DEFINING
STANDARD OF CARE
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

• Thomas R. and Jason L. Buchanan, Esq.
  • McDowell, Rice, Smith & Buchanan (Kansas City, MO)

• ASCE Task Force Committee (2013)
  • Chair Robert W. Thompson, ASCE Fellow (Denver, CO)
  • Consensus Guidelines for Defining Standard of Care
STANDARD OF CARE

- Why Is It Important?
- Common Definition
- Standard of Practice vs Standard of Care
- Bad Outcomes vs Negligence
- Venial Sins and Mortal Sins
- Non-Compliant Construction
WHY IS IT SO IMPORTANT?

- Legal consequences
- Triggers assertion of negligence
- Triggers professional liability (E & O)
- No shades of grey
WHY IS IT SO IMPORTANT?

• Serious business
• Who better to hold us accountable?
• No joy in concluding negligence
Common Definition

Standard of care is that level of care normally practiced by a reasonable and prudent professional\(^1\) under similar circumstances during the same time frame.

\(^1\) engineer, architect, doctor, lawyer, etc.
It is **not** perfection.
It is **not** defined by what **your** practice is
It is **not** that of the most highly skilled, nor is it even that of the average member of the profession or trade, since those who have less than median or average skill may still be competent and qualified.
Standard of care is that level of care normally practiced by a reasonable and prudent professional under similar circumstances during the same time frame.
SIMILAR CIRCUMSTANCES

- Contract
- Type of design
- Budget?
- Locality
LOCALITY

- Climate
- Seismicity
- Geological conditions
- “Local” practice
Standard of care is that level of care normally practiced by a reasonable and prudent professional under similar circumstances during the same time frame.
DURING THE SAME TIME FRAME

- Practices evolve over time
- Technology evolves
- Codes change
- Body of knowledge increases with time
What is the difference?

TOAD

FROG
STANDARD OF PRACTICE

- **Standard of practice** – what the profession typically does in a given circumstance and time frame.

- **Standards of practice** in the profession generally establish the **standard of care** to members practicing in that profession.
There are rare exceptions.

If there is competent expert evidence that the standard of practice creates an undue risk of harm then the standard of practice is not necessarily conclusive of the standard of care.

BAD OUTCOMES
vs NEGLIGENCE

“Those who hire engineers are not justified in expecting infallibility, but they can expect reasonable care and confidence. They purchase services not insurance.”

- Dr. Fu Hua Chen
Honorary Member
ASCE (1912 -1999)
BAD OUTCOMES
vs NEGLIGENCE

• Unless an engineer expressly agrees, he or she does not guarantee or promise success simply by providing professional services.

• An unsuccessful outcome does not by itself mean that an engineer or other design professional was negligent.

• Plaintiff must establish that the professional breached their duty and that this breach caused damage.
BAD OUTCOMES VS NEGLIGENCE

• **Examples:**
  - Doctor has a patient die
  - Roof collapse due to snow loads that greatly exceed design values in code
  - Fire truck drives onto and damages parking deck only designed for passenger cars
  - Lawyer loses a case
VENIAL SINS AND MORTAL SINS

• SOC ≠ Perfection

• All structural designs, drawings, and specifications have “errors”

• At what point does the number of small errors constitute falling below the SOC?

• Is one major error sufficient to conclude negligence?
VENIAL SINS
AND MORTAL SINS
“EXCEEDING” THE SOC

“Someone has said that an engineer is one who can do with $1 what any fool can do with $2.”

Jury Instruction: If construction of the building deviated in a material way from Engineer’s plans, specifications, or recommendations, then Engineer is not liable for the resulting damage if that damage occurred as a result of the deviation.

*Balcom Industries, Inc. v. Nelson (CO 1969)*
NON-COMPLIANT CONSTRUCTION
• Does the Standard of Care question apply to contractors?

• Their responsibilities relate to compliance with plans and specs plus good workmanship.

• A duty to make sure work is sufficiently free from defects and deficiencies, such that it meets the requirements of the Contract documents.
Standard of care is that level of care normally practiced by a reasonable and prudent professional\(^1\) under similar circumstances during the same time frame.

\(^1\) engineer, architect, doctor, lawyer, etc.
DEFINING
STANDARD OF CARE